

Akkreditierungsagentur für Studiengänge  
im Bereich Gesundheit und Soziales  
Accreditation Agency in Health and Social Sciences



## **Assessment Report**

**for the Application of  
Istanbul Gelişim University,  
School of Health Sciences,  
Department of Health Management  
for the Accreditation of the Bachelor Program  
“Health Management” (Bachelor of Science)  
(Turkish Program)**

AHPGS Akkreditierung gGmbH  
Sedanstr. 22  
79098 Freiburg  
Telefon: 0761/208533-0  
E-Mail: [ahpgs@ahpgs.de](mailto:ahpgs@ahpgs.de)

### Expert group

**Prof. Dr. Holger Höge**, Carl von Ossietzky University, Oldenburg, Germany

**Prof. Dr. Axel Olaf Kern**, University of Applied Sciences Ravensburg-Weingarten, Germany

***Prof. Dr. Birgit Leyendecker<sup>1</sup>***, Ruhr University Bochum, Germany

***Prof. Dr. Julian Löhe***, University of Applied Sciences, Rosenheim, Germany

***Prof. Dr. Hugo Mennemann***, University of Applied Sciences, Münster, Germany

**Prof. Dr. Christine Meyer**, University of Vechta, Germany

**Prof. Dr. Peter Schäfer**, Niederrhein University of Applied Sciences, Mönchengladbach, Germany

**Mrs. Julia Stiefel**, BA, Student at Friedrich Alexander University, Nürnberg, Germany

***Prof. Dr. Jürgen Zerth***, Wilhelm Löhe University of Applied Sciences, Fürth, Germany

**On-site visit** January 18-19, 2018

**Decision** April 30, 2018

---

<sup>1</sup> The expert listed in italics did not participate in the One-Site Visit.

## Table of Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Overview .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>2.1</b>	<b>Procedure-related documents .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>2.2</b>	<b>Study program .....</b>	<b>8</b>
2.2.1	Structural data .....	8
2.2.2	Qualification objectives and employment opportunities.....	9
2.2.3	Modularization and exam system.....	11
2.2.4	Admission requirements .....	17
<b>2.3</b>	<b>Study conditions and quality assurance .....</b>	<b>18</b>
2.3.1	Human resources.....	18
2.3.2	Facilities .....	19
2.3.3	Quality assurance .....	20
<b>2.4</b>	<b>Information about the University .....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Expert Report .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>3.1</b>	<b>Preliminary remarks .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>3.2</b>	<b>Basic information about the study program .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>3.3</b>	<b>Expert Report .....</b>	<b>25</b>
3.3.1	Program aims and their implementation .....	26
3.3.2	Structure of the study program .....	28
3.3.3	Admission and Feasibility .....	30
3.3.4	Examination system and transparency.....	32
3.3.5	Teaching staff and material equipment .....	33
3.3.6	Quality assurance .....	35
3.3.7	Gender equality and equal opportunities .....	36
<b>3.4</b>	<b>Summary.....</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission .....</b>	<b>40</b>

## 1 Introduction

The Accreditation Agency for Study Programs in Health and Social Sciences (AHPGS) is an interdisciplinary and multi-professional organization. Its mission is to evaluate Bachelor and Master's programs in the fields of health and social sciences, as well as in related domains, such as law or economics. By implementing accreditation and recommendation procedures, the AHPGS contributes to the improvement of the overall quality of teaching and learning. However, the higher education institutions remain responsible for fulfilling the quality assurance, too.

Since 2004 the AHPGS has been a member of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). In 2006, the AHPGS also joined the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA) and became a member of the International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education (INQAAHE) in 2009. Since 2012, the AHPGS has been a member of the Network of Central and Eastern European Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education (CEENQA). Starting from 2009, the AHPGS has been listed in the European Quality Assurance Register (EQAR).

In carrying out accreditation procedures, the AHPGS follows the requirements of the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG). In the present case, the decision regarding the accreditation of the study program is carried out by the AHPGS Accreditation Commission based on the following accreditation criteria<sup>2</sup>:

1. Program aims and learning outcomes
2. Curriculum design
3. Personnel
4. Facilities and learning resources
5. Study process and student assessment
6. Program and quality management
7. Gender equality and equal opportunity

---

<sup>2</sup> Approved by the AHPGS Accreditation Commission

The external assessment procedure is carried out in four steps:

### **I. The University's application**

The AHPGS verifies the sufficiency of the documents submitted by the University, namely the self-evaluation report and its corresponding annexes. These are to fulfill the assessment spheres as well as the AHPGS standards. As a result, the AHPGS produces a summary (see Sections 2-5), which is to be approved by the University and subsequently made available for the expert group, together with all other documentation.

### **II. Written review**

The main documents are reviewed by the expert group assigned by the accreditation commission of AHPGS. This is done in order to verify the compliance of the study program with the applicable accreditation criteria valid in Turkey. Consequently, the experts comprise a short summary regarding the study programs.

### **III. On-site visit (peer-review)**

The experts carry out an external on-site visit at the University. During this visit discussions are held with members of the University, which include University and department administration, degree program management, teachers and students. This provides the expert group with details about the study program beyond the written documents. The task of the experts during the on-site visit is to verify and evaluate the objectives of the program and its projected study results, its structure, staff, material resources, course of studies and methods of assessment (selection of students, assessment of achievements, students' support), as well as of the program management (program administration, external assurance of study quality).

Following the on-site visit, the expert group issues the expert report. This report is based on the results of the visit, the written review of the study programs, and the documents submitted by the University. Finally, the report is made available to the University so that it can issue a response opinion.

The expert report as well as the University's response opinion – together with the provided documents – is submitted to the accreditation commission of the AHPGS.

#### **IV. The AHPGS accreditation decision**

The accreditation commission of the AHPGS examines the documentation made available in the process of application, namely the University's self-evaluation report, its annexes, the summary comprised by the AHPGS, the expert report, as well as the University's response opinion. These documents represent the basis for the commission's decision regarding the recommendation for accreditation of the study program. Consequently, this decision – together with all other documentation – is forwarded to the AHPGS Accreditation Commission for it to reach a decision regarding the accreditation of the study program.

## 2 Overview

### 2.1 Procedure-related documents

The Istanbul Gelişim University, Istanbul, Turkey delegated the task of accrediting its Bachelor study program “Health Management” to AHPGS.

The self-evaluation report for accreditation (without the awarding of the official seal of the German Accreditation Council) of the above-mentioned study programs (hereinafter the SER) of the Istanbul Gelişim University (hereinafter the University) was submitted to AHPGS in electronic format on August 25, 2017. The contract between the Istanbul Gelişim University and the AHPGS was signed on May 9, 2017.

On November 16, 2017, the AHPGS forwarded the open questions and explanatory notes (hereinafter OQ) pertaining to the Application for accreditation for the study programs to the University. On November 24, 2017, the University submitted the answers to the open questions and explanatory notes (hereinafter AOO) to the AHPGS in electronic format.

The present document presents the summary of the AHPGS for the Bachelor study program “Health Management”.

The application documentation submitted by the University follows the outline recommended by the AHPGS. Along with the application request towards accreditation of the Bachelor study program “Health Management”, the following additional documents can be found in the application package (the documents submitted by the University are numbered in the following order for easier referencing):

Specific documents for the Bachelor study program “Health Management”:

Annex	Description
1	Curriculum Table of the Department of Health Management
2	Module Description of Health Management
3	Full Course Matrix
4	Health Management Students
5	CVs
6	Health Management Library Details

Alongside the study-program-specific documents, the following documents pertain to all study programs submitted to AHPGS for evaluation:

Annex	Description
A	Directive on Training and Examination of Associate and Undergraduate Students in IGU
B	Occupational Practice File
C	Application Form for 'I Have an Idea'
D	University Decision and Management Structure
E	Course and Lecturer Assessment Questionnaire
F	Student Satisfaction Questionnaire
G	Follow-Up Form for Graduated Students
H	Welcome to Gelişim Practice Form
I	Organization Chart
J	Private Budget
K	IGU Traineeship Directive
L	Student Traineeship File
M	Preparatory Class Curriculum
N	University's Internal Structure
O	IGU Directive On Disabled People Counseling And Coordination Unit
P	Directive On Lateral Transfers
Q	Directive On Equivalence And Adaptation On IGU
R	Directive on Double Major in IGU
S	Turkish Law on Higher Education
T	Higher Education System in Turkey
U	Directive on Equivalence and Adaptation at IGU
V	Regulation on Higher Education Quality Assurance

The Summary, the Expert Report as well as the resolution of the Accreditation Commission build the basis for the present Assessment Report.

## 2.2 Study program

### 2.2.1 Structural data

University	Istanbul Gelişim University, Istanbul, Turkey
Faculty/Department	School of Health Sciences Department of Health Management



Cooperation partner	None; no shared training or education (SER 1.1.2)
Title of the study program	"Health Management"
Degree awarded	Bachelor of Science (B.Sc.)
Form of studies	Full-time
Language of study	Turkish
Period of education	Eight semesters
Credit Points (CP) according to the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS)	240 ECTS points
Hours/CP	25.5 Hours/ECTS point
Workload	Total: 6,120 hours Contact hours: 1,904 hours Individual work: 4,216 hours
Thesis	None
Launch date of the study program	Academic year 2012-2013
First accreditation	Program has not been accredited before
Time of admission	Fall, annually
Current number of students	184 (an average of 46 per cohort)
Tuition fees	TRY 33,960 (ca. EUR 7,800) per academic year.  Merit scholarships covering 30% of the tuition fees, 50% of the tuition fees, 100% of the tuition fees, and 100% of the tuition fees plus a USD 1,000 (ca. EUR 850) monthly grant are available based on A-Levels or IB scores.  When paying tuition fees by installments, an additional fee of 6% is assessed.

Table 1: Structural data of the study program

### 2.2.2 Qualification objectives and employment opportunities

The University envisions the overall goal of the Bachelor study program "Health Management" to be the protection and improvement of the health of the community by developing an adaptive and globally integrated health sector. The program is supposed to contribute to the development of health poli-

cies and to the training of health managers to ensure that public and private sector institutions operate at world standards. Graduates are supposed to have knowledge about the national health system and national health policies, to adopt medical deontology and to cooperate with health workers through speaking and understanding their language. To this end, it has developed qualification objectives for its students and divided these into four categories.

Regarding the first, **scientific or artistic qualification**, graduates will be able to use advanced knowledge and skills to scientifically interpret and evaluate topics in the field of health management, and will also have the ability to define, analyze, investigate and develop solutions by considering professional values, ethics, and the available evidence. Sharing knowledge effectively and good teamwork skills also belong to this category.

Next, in the category of **occupation qualification**, the University foresees that graduates will engage in disciplined data collection, interpretation, application and dissemination; act in accordance with social, scientific, cultural and ethical values; independently work using advanced knowledge of the Health Management field; and take responsibility as a team member.

Thirdly, in the category of **social responsibility qualification**, the University states that graduates will be capable of informing concerned parties about Health Management-related matters, of conveying opinions and suggestions for solutions to problems verbally and in writing, and of listening to the opinions, requests and expectations of concerned parties.

Finally, in the category of **personality development**, the University expects that students will use a critical approach to evaluate advanced knowledge and skills in the field of Health Management.

The University states that graduates are awarded the statutory title of “Health Manager” and can be employed, among others, at central and provincial parts of the Ministry of Health, the Social Security Institution, and public and private health institutions (SER 1.4.1).

The ongoing health reforms and developments in Turkey and abroad, according to the University, will create a need for graduates of the “Health Management” program.

### 2.2.3 Modularization and exam system

Study programs at IGU are set together out of University-wide compulsory courses which are centrally defined by the Turkish Higher Education Council, departmental compulsory courses and intra- and extra-departmental elective courses.

The program as a whole comprises 48 modules, out of which 38 are obligatory and ten are compulsory elective modules. Regarding the ten elective modules, seven are intra-departmental whereas three are extra-departmental and open to students from many disciplines. All modules have to be completed within eight semesters. One module is no longer than one semester. There are between six and eight modules in total provided for each semester. Each semester comprises a workload of 30 ECTS credit points. Students may go abroad on an Erasmus + basis by special agreement with the University.

The following study plan lists the University-required sequence of courses for the attainment of the degree Bachelor of Science (B.Sc.) in "Health Management."

Semester	Course Nr.	Course Title	CP	ECTS
1 (Fall)	TRD101	Turkish Language I	2	2
	YDI103	Foreign Language I	3	3
	SYY101	General Economy I	3	6
	SYY103	Sociology	2	2
	ISF103	The Basic Concepts of Law	3	5
	ISL101	Introduction to Business	3	6
	ISL103	Accounting I	3	6
Semester Total			19	30
2 (Spring)	TRD102	Turkish Language II	2	2
	YDI104	Foreign Language II	3	3
	SYY102	General Economy II	3	6
	SYY104	Organizational Behavior	3	6
	HIT106	Social Psychology	3	4
	ISL102	Management and Organization	3	4
	ISL104	Accounting II	3	5

			Semester Total	20	30
3 (Fall)	ATA201	History of Ataturk's Principles and Reforms I	2	2	
	SYY201	Business Management I	3	8	
	SYY203	Insurance Accounting	3	6	
	IBY202	Cost Accounting	3	3	
	SYY205	Health Tourism	3	5	
	SYY207	Biostatistics	3	6	
			Semester Total	17	30
4 (Spring)	ATA202	History of Ataturk's Principles and Reforms II	2	2	
	SYY202	Business Management II	3	8	
	ISL204	Marketing Management	3	4	
	One of the following electives: Insurance Operations (SYY204), Communication Theories (RTS314)		3	6	
	ISL208	Financial Statement Analysis	3	5	
	ISL210	Insurance Operations	3	5	
			Semester Total	17	30
5 (Fall)	ISL305	Human Resources Management	3	4	
	SYY301	Management of Healthcare Organizations I	3	4	
	SYY303	Medical Terminology	3	5	
	ISL307	Financial Management	3	5	
	One of the following electives: Health Research Methods (SYY309), Sociology of Health (SOS311)		3	6	
	One of the following electives: Planning and Management on Public Relations (HIT201), Digital Marketing (HIT401), Current Management Approaches and Total Quality Management (ISL401), Commercial Law (SYY305), Administrative Structure of Turkey (HIT207), Introduction to Psychology (PSI103)		3	6	
			Semester Total	18	30
5 (Fall)	ISL312	Financial Management II	3	5	

	SYY302	Management of Healthcare Organizations II	3	4
	ISL306	International Business	2	3
	<u>One of the following electives:</u> Human Rights (SOS314), Health Insurance (SYY304)		3	6
	<u>One of the following electives:</u> Medical Accounting (SYY306), Academic Reading and Writing (SOS316)		3	6
	<u>One of the following electives:</u> Human Rights (SOS314), Media and Public Opinion (HIT302), Radio and Television Advertising (RTR205), Labor and Social Security Law (ISY304), Statistics (ISF204)		3	6
Semester Total			17	30
7 (Fall)	ISL407	Strategic Business Management	3	5
	ISL413	Investment Management	3	5
	SYY401	Hospital Automation I	3	8
	<u>One of the following electives:</u> Pharmaceutical Economy (SYY403), Medical and Psychiatric Social Service (SHY403)		3	6
	<u>One of the following electives:</u> Facilities and Resource Planning in Health Care (SYY407), Health Services Management (SYY405)		3	6
Semester Total			15	30
8 (Spring)	SYY404	Healthcare Information and First Aid	3	5
	ISL402	Audit	3	5
	SYY402	Hospital Automation II	3	8
	<u>One of the following electives:</u> Communication Ethics (RTS402), Health Law Legislation (SYY406)		3	6
	<u>One of the following electives:</u> Sign Language (ISF402), Entrepreneurship (GIR402), Negotiation Techniques (UTI410), Customer Relations (MIY208), Political Communication (RTS302), Advertising Campaigns (HIT402), Brand Management (HIT306), Social Psychology (SOS318)		3	6
Semester Total			15	30
<b>Study Program Total</b>			<b>138</b>	<b>240</b>

Table 2: Study Plan

The module descriptions (Annex 2) contain information on course names and codes, course level, semester of study, in-class hours, credit points, ECTS points, language of instruction, course type, mode of delivery, name of course coordinator and instructor(s), pre- and corequisites, objectives and contents, key learning outcomes, weekly course contents, source materials, assessment methods and grade weighting, level of contribution of course units to learning outcomes, and the constitution of course workload and ECTS credits.

In the **first semester**, students take an array of general courses intended to ensure a satisfactory level of language competence ("Turkish Language I," "Foreign Language I") and basic financial knowledge ("General Economy I," "Introduction to Business," "Accounting I"). In addition to these, "Sociology" and "The Basic Concepts of Law" give students a foundation in those humanities which are necessary for health management.

In the **second semester**, several courses extend basic knowledge conferred in the first semester, namely "Turkish Language II," "Foreign Language II," "General Economy II" and "Accounting II." "Organizational Behavior" and "Management and Organization" teach effective record-keeping and successful organization techniques, while "Social Psychology" branches off of previously taught sociological concepts.

In the **third semester**, students take a course in Turkish history and culture. Apart from this, courses are concentrated solely on health management concerns. "Business Management I" teaches the basics of company leadership in the context of healthcare; "Insurance Accounting" and "Cost Accounting" with a vital part of health management; "Health Tourism" teaches students to think of healthcare and its facets internationally; and "Biostatistics" gives students skills in evaluating statistics in healthcare responsibly and effectively.

In the **fourth semester**, another course in Turkish history and culture is taken, as well as the follow-up course "Business Management II." This is supplemented by "Marketing Management," "Financial Statement Analysis" and "Insurance Operations," to ensure students can demonstrate proficiency in each subject and not just in composite business management courses. Students also take one elective course.

In the **fifth semester**, “Medical Terminology” ensures that students are literate with medical terms and able to communicate with doctors, patients and insurance companies. “Human Resources Management” and “Financial Management” further teach the responsible handling of vital business matters, whereas “Management of Healthcare Organizations I” puts these concepts into a stricter healthcare context. Two further electives are taken.

In the **sixth semester**, students take the follow-up courses “Financial Management II” and “Management of Healthcare Organizations II.” “International Business,” together with the earlier “Health Tourism” course, develops students’ ability to think in an entrepreneurial sense beyond borders and about the healthcare needs of various world communities. Three electives are also taken.

In the **seventh semester**, “Strategic Business Management” and “Investment Management” focus on business health and growth, and how good leadership can be conducive to these. “Hospital Automation I” delves into the expanding industry of machine-based healthcare. Students take two further elective courses.

Finally, in the **eighth semester**, students follow up with “Hospital Automation II.” In the course “Audit,” students learn the value of rigorous organization and bookkeeping, as well as how to comply with audits and record examinations. “Healthcare Information and First Aid” provides students with the ability to assist those in need of medical help due to their future proximity with patients. Two electives are also taken.

Learning concepts in these courses are to be conveyed through instructor-selected methods of teaching, including lecture method, question-answer method, small group activities, role play, brainstorming, group discussion, and demonstration (SER 1.2.4).

According to the University, certain courses (determined by the University Senate) are taught online as distance education classes. These generally consist of entry-level and/or general requirement courses such as Foreign Language I-II, IT, Introduction to Psychology, Turkish Language I-II, and Ataturk’s Principles and History of Revolution I-II. Materials for these courses can be found through the University’s Student Information System (OBIS) (SER 1.2.5).

The Turkish Council of Higher Education (YOK) has decided to involve the Department of Health Management in the National Core Education Project, which entails that field study and traineeship programs will be added in accordance with this regulation (SER 1.2.6).

The University states to have structured the Bachelor study program “Health Management” based on the Bologna System using ECTS credit points in order to facilitate international recognition of credits and degrees. The study program is only available in Turkish, with several hours of English instruction in the first year. Studies abroad are said to be possible through the Erasmus+ program, which has enabled an average of 44 outbound exchanges<sup>3</sup> per annum for the last four years.

Examinations in the program are carried out according to the “Directive on Training and Examination of Associate and Undergraduate Students in IGU” (Annex A). The University uses a combination of continuous and final assessments with a 40:60 ratio. Assessment types include exams, quizzes, field works, practices, homework, workshops, seminars, laboratories, traineeships and similar activities. Assessment methods and their numerical weights are given in the module descriptions. (Annex A, Article 23-1)

Grades are issued by the University on a scale of AA (4.00 GPA, 90-100%) down to FF (0.00 GPA, 0-39%). DD (GPA 1.00, 45-49%) is the lowest passing score; students receiving this or a higher score in a course are barred from repeating the course to improve their grade. A Cumulative GPA (CGPA or GANO) is the credit-weighted average GPA over a student’s history at the University. Students with high CGPAs may take higher-level courses from the third semester onward. (Annex A, Article 16-2)

There are a total of 48 midterm and 48 final exams in the study program, totaling 96 exams. One week out of the 16-week semester is reserved for each type of exam. Students who fail courses, as well as those who miss final exams due to excused absences, are required to repeat the course or exam, respectively. Make-up exams only apply if students have attended at least 70% of theoretical meetings and 80% of laboratory meetings in the course. (Annex A, Article 17-1, 2)

---

<sup>3</sup> from the entire University



The recognition of credits transferred from other universities (domestic and abroad) according to the requirements of the Lisbon Recognition Convention is regulated through the Directive on Lateral Transfers (Annex P). The major requirements set forth in the Directive are a satisfactory grade point average and available space in the transfer quota set by the Council of Higher Education.

Compensation measures for students with disabilities are given in the IGU Directive On Disabled People Counseling And Coordination Unit (Annex O). The stated aim of the Directive is to “ease” and “facilitate the life of disabled students” when necessary.

#### **2.2.4 Admission requirements**

The procedure pertaining to the admission procedure is centrally regulated and executed by the Turkish Student Selection and Placement Center (OSYM) and corresponds with the provisions of the Turkish Law on Higher Education No. 2547 (Annex S). Students are admitted to institutions of higher education by means of an examination prepared in accordance with provisions specified by the Turkish Council of Higher Education (YOK). In the evaluation of examination results, the performance of students during their secondary education is taken into account. Those performing well in University special talent exams can similarly be placed directly into a program requiring such talent. (Annex A, Article 5; SER 1.5.1)

Those students who are not placed into any university by OSYM are eligible to apply for any remaining free places in programs at the University. (Ibid.)

The registration of the students who are entitled to enroll in the programs of Istanbul Gelişim University is done by the Department of Student Affairs/Registrar’s Office. The admission process at the University is regulated by the “Directive on Training and Examination of Associate and Undergraduate Students in IGU” (Annex A, Article 5) according to the above mentioned law.

Well-performing students may elect to combine two fields of study through the Double Major Program. To be eligible for this program, students must hold a GPA of at least 2.72 out of 4.00, be in the best-performing 20% of their cohort and have no record of disciplinary action at the University. The Double Major Program is regulated by the “IGU Double Major Directive” (not available in English).

## 2.3 Study conditions and quality assurance

### 2.3.1 Human resources

The University has stated that it plans to hire one full or associate professor and two assistant professors in the Department of Health Management. In addition, twelve instructional staff members, one other full-time assistant professor and two research assistants currently teach in the Department. Instructors from other faculties also teach courses; in a recent academic year, a total of 24 instructors taught in the program.

For details about the qualifications of the teaching staff in the “Health Management” department as well as about the covering and distribution of the course load in the study program, the University provided short CVs of the teaching staff (Annex 5) and a teaching matrix (Annex 3).

The weekly teaching load for instructors and lecturers employed at a Turkish University is to be determined by the Council of Higher Education (YOK), with a minimum of 12 hours per week (Annex S, Article 36). Rectors, Deans, Directors of Graduate Schools and Schools of Higher Education are exempted from the requirement of the weekly teaching load. The weekly teaching load for Vice-Rectors, Assistant Deans, and Assistant Directors of Graduate Schools and Schools of Higher Education and for Heads of Departments is half the regularly specified term (*ibid.*).

According to the University, the requirement of teaching staff is determined at the beginning of the semester by the heads of department and the directorate of the School of Health Sciences and reported to the rector’s office. The rectorate announces job vacancies and appoints teaching staff according to the (qualification) requirements of the Turkish Higher Education Law (Annex S, part 5).

The University states that the teaching staff is provided with the right to participate in the training programs organized by the University’s “IGU Continuing Education Center”, the right to participate in scientific research projects, international symposiums and conferences and in advanced training programs related to the department/study program (SER 2.1.2).

### 2.3.2 Facilities

The University's campus comprises the buildings with lecture halls and classrooms, laboratories, two student canteens as well as several cafeterias, a sports complex and a health center for emergency and daily poly-clinic services.

Additionally, the University Istanbul Gelişim University signed agreements with the residences to provide student accommodation.

In Part A of Annex N "IGU's Internal Structure", the University listed its laboratories with their respective equipment. The University disposes an Anatomy Laboratory, an Audiometry Laboratory, a Biomedical Laboratory, a Child Development Laboratory, a Dental Prosthesis Laboratory, a Dialysis Laboratory, an Electro Neurophysiology Laboratory, an Ergotherapy Laboratory, a Physical Exercise Laboratory, a First and Emergency Aid Laboratory, a Hair and Beauty Laboratory, a Medical Laboratory, a Nursing Laboratory, a Nutrition and Dietetics Laboratory, an Optician Laboratory, an Oral and Dental Laboratory, an Orthosis Prosthesis Laboratory, a Pathology Techniques Laboratory, a Perfusion Laboratory and a Physiology Laboratory.

Students studying "Health Management" have access to the University's three libraries, the Central Library, the Art and Engineering Library and the Vocational College Library. According to Part A of Annex N "IGU's Internal Structure", IGU's libraries hold 35,702 printed books, 164,452 e-books, 22,803 e-magazines, 3,341 e-standards and three databases. The University states that the library owns 58 program-specific books (SER 2.3.2).

Through the government's Turkish Academic Network and Information Center (ULAKBIM), IGU's staff and students access 1.237 health-related e-journals and another nine databases. Twice a year, the heads of departments may request the purchase of new publications.

The Central Library is open Monday to Friday from 8:30 to 21:30, in summer term until 18:30. The libraries do not serve on weekends. Students may also access the library's resources through IGU's online catalogue "Kütüphane" off-campus and out of opening hours.

### 2.3.3 Quality assurance

The Turkish Higher Education Council (CoHE, YOK) has founded a semi-independent quality board. The board has issued its own directives. Each university has founded its own quality office and commissions which are handled by directives. The CoHE quality board orients to the European Higher Education System and standards for quality assurance.

Quality assurance at the University is based on the target of maintaining a structure in line with international standards in education, research and administration. The University states that ensuring the participation of all internal and external stakeholders is a priority (SER 1.6.1).

The University maintains an Office of Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance, which is responsible for measuring, evaluating and continuously improving the performance at the University. Additionally, there exists a University Quality Committee, the duties of which include establishment of internal and external quality assurance systems, conducting internal evaluation studies, preparing an annual institutional evaluation report and to make necessary preparations in the external evaluation process.

According to the CoHE Quality board's regulations, the University has to submit its self-evaluation reports to the CoHE Quality board each year in April. These reports have to be publicly accessible.

Subordinate to the University Quality Committee exists the College Quality Committee, a team of similar type specific to the College of Health Sciences. The College Quality Committee sets and monitors various quality assurance goals, reporting to the Rectorate and analyzing feedback from all stakeholders, including students and employers.

These quality assurance units are contained within a Strategic Plan for the University in the timeframe 2016-2020. The University states that the Strategic Plan is currently revised and was, thus, not submitted (AOQ). Instead, the Directive on Quality Assurance at IGU and Directives on Quality Commission and the Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance Office at IGU, which have been prepared during the revision process, are being used this year but are not available in English (Ibid.). In the plan, the goals of establishing a working quality system related to education and training and cooperating with external

accreditors to evaluate its progress are listed. The University states that student-centered, effective communication lies at the core of its strategy.

For module evaluation, students are required to fill out questionnaires pertaining to their satisfaction with the quality of the study program, its individual modules, the teaching staff and their course workload (Annexes E and F). The University Quality Committee then assesses the reports and uses them to set targets and determine corrective/proactive action, if necessary. Students furthermore have the opportunity to evaluate their field studies using a similar questionnaire. The Rector's Office is directly in charge of all quality improvement tasks and processes.

The Quality Committee puts itself in contact with University graduates and invites them to report their experiences using a form (Annex G). Additionally, there is an Alumni Association and a University web portal specifically for alumni, intended to facilitate the graduate feedback process (SER 1.6.4).

The University states that due to the young age of the study program, exact statistics regarding the evaluation of student workload are still being prepared.

Since the program started, a total of 185 students have been enrolled in the program. The first graduates are expected in the academic year 2017-2018. The University states that, so far, no students dropped out of the program (AOQ 9).

General information about the study program is published on the University's website at <http://gbs.gelisim.edu.tr>. Policy aspects, including e.g. examination regulations, rights for disabled students, transfer requirements etc. are either available online or in person at University offices.

Lecturers have two office hours each week, which are made known to students. Counseling days and hours are also disseminated electronically; the University's Psychological Counseling and Guidance Center assists students in crises or struggling with mental health problems. A Career Development Coordinator and the Continuing Education Application and Research Center help plan students' postgraduate pathways. Furthermore, a mentoring program exists within the College, allowing qualified students to undergo professional training and become mentors to their peers; currently, there are 2 mentors in the Department of Health Management.

For disabled students, a University regulation (Annex O) has established a Disabled Students Unit and sets compensation measures and assistance practices. The Unit aims to facilitate the learning life of disabled students, regardless of financial background or other characteristics. For more information, please refer to Annex O and SER 1.6.10.

## **2.4 Information about the University**

The University as it is today was founded in 2011 by the Gelişim Education Culture Health and Social Service Foundation. Previously, in 2008, the foundation had attempted to found a vocational school under the name "Istanbul Gelişim Vocational College," which Turkey's Ministry of National Education recognized. When the University was established, education commenced in three faculties and one vocational college. Since then, the number of institutes and programs in colleges and faculties of the University has grown; currently the University consists of three institutes (Social Sciences, Science and Technology, Health Sciences), three faculties (Engineering and Architecture; Economic, Administrative and Social Sciences; Fine Arts), two vocational colleges (Istanbul Gelişim Vocational College, Health Services Vocational College) and four colleges (Health Sciences, Applied Sciences, Physical Education and Sports, Foreign Languages).

The University is currently acting on its Strategic Plan 2016-2020, which is heavily based upon expanding its quality assurance concept and achieving external accreditation.

The School of Health Sciences was established in 2012 and currently offers ten Bachelor study programs, for five of them also an English track: Audiology, Child Development, Ergotherapy, Health Management, Nursing, Nutrition and Dietetics, Orthosis/Prosthesis, Perfusion, Physiotherapy and Rehabilitation, and Social Services. In total, 2,715 students are currently enrolled in the School of Health Sciences.

### 3 Expert Report

#### 3.1 Preliminary remarks

The Accreditation Agency in Health and Social Sciences (hereupon, the AHPGS) was commissioned by Istanbul Gelisim University, Istanbul, Turkey (hereupon, the University) to accredit the study programs “Health Management” (Bachelor of Science), “Child Development” (Bachelor of Science) and “Social Service” (Bachelor of Science).

The on-site visit evaluation of the study program “Health Management,” as well as the study programs “Child Development” and “Social Service,” offered at the Istanbul Gelisim University, was carried out on January 18-19, 2018, at the Istanbul Gelisim University, Istanbul, Turkey.

The following experts were appointed by the Accreditation Commission of AHPGS for the evaluation of the study program.

#### **As representatives of higher education institutions:**

##### **Prof. Dr. Holger Höge**

Carl von Ossietzky University, Oldenburg, Germany  
Professor of Psychology

##### **Prof. Dr. Axel Olaf Kern**

University of Applied Sciences Ravensburg-Weingarten, Germany  
Professor of Health Economics and Social Management

##### ***Prof. Dr. Birgit Leyendecker<sup>4</sup>***

*Ruhr University Bochum, Germany  
Professor of Developmental Psychology*

##### ***Prof. Dr. Hugo Mennemann***

*University of Applied Sciences, Münster, Germany  
Professor of Social Work*

##### **Prof. Dr. Christine Meyer**

University of Vechta, Vechta, Germany  
Professor of Social Work over the Life Span

##### **Prof. Dr. Peter Schäfer**

Niederrhein University of Applied Sciences, Mönchengladbach, Germany  
Professor of Family and Youth Welfare Law in the Context of Social Work

---

<sup>4</sup> The experts shown in italics did not participate in the on-site visit of the University.

**Prof. Dr. Jürgen Zerth**

*Wilhelm Löhe University of Applied Sciences, Fürth, Germany  
Professor of Health Economics*

**As student representative:****Ms. Julia Stiefel**

Master's Studies in Health Management and Health Economics at Friedrich Alexander University, Nürnberg, Germany

According to the *Rules for the Accreditation of Study Programs and for System Accreditation* (determined by the decision of the Accreditation Commission, of 08.12.2009 in the version of 20.02.2013, Drs. AR 20/2013), the task of the experts in the accreditation procedures is to evaluate the education concept of a specific study program as well as to estimate the possibility of its successful implementation. This concerns, in particular, qualification objectives of the study program, its conceptual integration into the system of education, the concept of the study program, feasibility of the content and scope of studies, the examination system, study-relevant collaborations, personnel, material and space resources, transparency and documentation, application of the results of quality assurance for further development of the study program (it is especially important to present the analyses and evaluation results of student workload, academic accomplishments and employment of graduates, which are to be documented and taken into account within the framework of continuous development of the study program), as well as the provision of gender equality and equal opportunities.

The on-site visit of the experts is carried out in accordance with the *Rules for the Accreditation of Study Programs and for System Accreditation* (determined by the decision of the Accreditation Commission, of 08.12.2009 in the version of 20.02.2013, Drs. AR 20/2013) as well as the *Criteria for the assessment and accreditation procedures of study programs at foreign higher education institutions* developed by AHPGS. After the announcement of the accreditation decision, the expert report will be published as a part of the final Assessment Report.

**3.2 Basic information about the study program**

The main objective of the Bachelor study program "Health Management" offered at the School of Health Sciences of the Istanbul Gelisim University is to educate professionals capable of working in administrative and leadership



capacities at healthcare institutions as well as of enabling persons to take over responsibility in the healthcare sector to contribute to the development of health policies and the health sector.

The study program requires the obtainment of 240 credit points (CP) according to the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). One CP is equal to 25.5 workload hours. The total workload of the program constitutes 6,120 hours, of which 1,904 are contact hours and 4,216 are hours of independent study. It is a full-time study program with a regular duration of four years/eight semesters. The program curriculum consists of 48 modules/courses, of which 38 are obligatory and ten are elective.

Students are admitted to institutions of higher education by means of an examination prepared in accordance with provisions specified by the Turkish Measuring, Selection and Placement Center (OSYM). In the evaluation of examination results, the performance of students during their secondary education is taken into account. Upon completion of the study program, students are awarded with the academic title "Bachelor of Science." The number of annually available study places in the program is determined annually by the Turkish Higher Education Council (YÖK) according to the University's resources. Admission takes place every winter semester. The study program is offered in Turkish language. The first batch of students was admitted to the program in the academic year 2014/2015. The University charges tuition fees.

### **3.3 Expert Report**

The on-site visit was carried out on January 18-19, 2018, according to the previously agreed schedule. Representatives from the head office of AHPGS accompanied the expert group.

The expert group met on January 17, 2018, for preliminary talks prior to the on-site visit. They discussed the submitted application documents and the results of the written evaluation as well as questions that had been raised. Furthermore, they prepared the plan of the on-site visit at the University.

In the course of the on-site visit, experts conducted discussions with the University management, representatives of the School of Health Sciences, the teaching staff of the programs "Child Development", "Health Management" and "Social Service" as well as with students currently studying in the programs. Furthermore, they inspected the learning premises, such as lecture

halls, seminar classrooms, library, and computer classes. Moreover, experts had the opportunity to see the equipment and the capacity of the laboratories.

The expert report is structured in compliance with the Accreditation Criteria of AHPGS, which were last revised on 21.07.2015 and approved by the Accreditation Commission of AHPGS on 30.09.2015. The study program will be described and analyzed in a comprehensive manner below. The documents submitted by the University, the experts' feedback to the documents, the observations made during the on-site visit, the results of discussions with the representatives of the University, the School of Health Sciences and the Department of Health Management serve as the basis for the statements made in the expert report.

### **3.3.1 Program aims and their implementation**

The Bachelor study program "Health Management" pursues specific qualification objectives. The program is intended to train students for executive careers in the national and international healthcare markets. It is also intended to prepare students to contribute to and to develop health policies on the one hand, and to enable students for working within healthcare institutions and in several businesses in the healthcare market. Learning outcomes for the program include the ability for graduates to define, analyze, investigate and develop solutions by weighing evidence and ethics; to work together and share knowledge, to engage in disciplined data collection, interpretation, and application; to work autonomously when necessary and to take responsibility for their actions; to inform concerned persons and institutions, including conveying opinions and suggestions in written and oral form, and receiving responses and opinions from concerned parties; and to be able to evaluate advanced knowledge through critical thinking.

The experts find that these objectives cover professional, interdisciplinary and personal aspects and refer to the domain of academic competences, necessary employment qualifications, skills of social commitment and personality development. The learning outcomes of the study program correspond to the offered degree.

As the curricula in Turkey are designed in close accordance with the national requirements set by the Turkish Higher Education Council (YÖK), the University defined qualification objectives comprising scientific qualification as well as

the qualification to engage in a qualified occupation, to take over social responsibility and to bring forward their personal development.

The experts also discuss the English title of the study program. From the experts' point of view, the structure of the program resembles a "Healthcare Management" program rather than a "Health Management" program. Students deal with the healthcare system from a macro- as well as from a micro-perspective. Currently, the program is only offered in Turkish language and has been, thus, developed and promoted with the Turkish title only. The Department representatives on site confirm uncertainty and inconsistency in the English translation of the program's title which is listed variously on University documents and websites as "Health Management", "Healthcare Management" and "Health Administration." To clarify this uncertainty, the experts see the need to sharpen the profile of the study program and define clear qualification objectives and with regard to the employability of the graduates. The Department of Health Management should outline whether students are supposed to be qualified as future leaders and managers with analytic competences regarding action fields and stakeholders, or whether their studies should place a greater focus on diagnostic and therapeutic approaches, such as incorporating preventive strategies or therapy management. The experts note that the structure and contents of the program best resemble a curriculum for a "Health Care Management" program; the question thus arises as to whether this should also be reflected in the program description. Equally important to check is whether the title of "Health Manager," which students of the program receive upon graduation and has long been a recognized credential in Turkey, can adequately be conferred on graduates of the study program. To this extent, it is helpful to refine the study program's objectives in terms of showing a clearer employability of graduates.

Moreover, the University states to aim at becoming a higher education institution of international renown. In the experts' opinion, also therefore it is necessary to outline a particular profile in order to be internationally visible and recognized.

As a whole, the experts acknowledge a high orientation on the labor market's needs and appreciate the Department's commitment to qualify the students for a demanding job market.

From the experts' point of view, the requirements of this criterion are partially fulfilled. The profile of the study program has to be refined and clear qualification objectives and with regard to the employability of the graduates have to be defined.

### **3.3.2 Structure of the study program**

The Bachelor study program "Health Management" is a full-time study program with a regular duration of four years (eight semesters). The program curriculum consists of 48 courses, each of them one semester in length. To the experts this appears as a very detailed curriculum, consisting of a large number of more or less isolated courses. A modular structure is not yet implemented but should be aspired to. However, the combination and sequence of the courses of the study program are consistent with the earlier described specified qualification objectives. In the experts' opinion, a more comprehensive curriculum design with a modular structure would help clarifying the study program's aim and profile.

The study program requires the obtainment of 240 credit points (CP) according to the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). One CP is equal to 25.5 workload hours. This is determined in Article 11 (7) of the University's "Directive on Training and Examination of Associate and Undergraduate Students". The total workload of the program constitutes 6,120 hours, of which 1,904 are contact hours and 4,216 are hours of independent study. It is a full-time study program with a regular duration of four years/eight semesters. The program curriculum consists of 48 semester-long courses, of which 38 are obligatory and ten are elective.

The program consists of compulsory courses (determined centrally by YÖK, such as "Turkish Language I+II" and "Ataturk's Principles and Revolution History I+II"), compulsory departmental courses (determined by the Turkish National Core Curriculum) as well as of departmental and non-departmental elective courses (determined and designed by Istanbul Gelisim University). The experts have ascertained that a strong general management and economic approach exists in the curriculum, supplemented by sociological and psychological aspects in the first years. The courses follow a consistent and plausible structure, beginning with introductory courses and basic sciences, accumulating more specialized knowledge and applied competences through successive courses in the upper semesters. After having acquired basic knowledge in the

first four semesters, students may design an increasingly individual qualification. By choosing ten electives from a large variety of elective courses (6 ECTS each) in semesters 4 to 8, students may emphasize on general non-area electives or gain additional knowledge in field-related topics such as "Health Insurance", "Medical Accounting", "Pharmaceutical Economy" or "Facilities and Resource Planning in Health Care" for a total scope of 60 ECTS credits. Thus, the study program provides students with specialized and interdisciplinary knowledge as well as professional, methodological and general competences.

On site, the experts learned that besides non-program specific compulsory courses such as "Turkish Language" and "Atatürk's Principles and Revolution History", YÖK defines also up to 75 % of the program-specific contents through a National Core Curriculum. The remaining 25-30 % of the new curriculum should be aimed at implementing the institution's own specific aims for each program, individual development goals, expectations and requirements of the students and should include elective courses offered by other programs.

From the experts' point of view, the Department of Health Management should use the remaining development margin from the National Core Curriculum and include or transparently outline central topics in order to make visible reference to the healthcare system and to contrast from general management. First, the Department should depict and intensify the examination of institutions, organizations and processes with a more specific connection to the context of the healthcare system. Second, the experts consider an insight into medical and healthcare professions helpful in order to acquire a better and deeper understanding of the healthcare system. Third, the study program needs courses in epidemiology and public health. Fourth, the examination and comparison of international healthcare systems and of the Turkish healthcare system should be implemented or become visible in the curriculum. Fifth, as a Bachelor degree requires methodological and statistical skills, the experts also agree that the training in academic and research skills should be implemented visibly, more intensely and earlier in the curriculum.

Currently, the study program does not contain an internship. In order to strengthen the applied competences of the students, the experts strongly

recommend implementing structured cooperation with healthcare institutions and healthcare providers and, at least, conducting organized field trips.

On site, the experts learned that the study program currently undergoes a development process and that some of the above mentioned recommendations have already been considered. For example, the National Core Education Project allows for adding a traineeship in accordance with YÖK's decision and regulations. The experts acknowledge and appreciate the Department's awareness of necessary changes and find the ideas and initiated steps for further development convincing.

Apart from the program's contents, the experts consider the program structure with 48 courses as too fragmented and overloaded with examinations. Although the modules reflect in a very detailed way the national requirements of a health management study program as laid down in the National Core Curriculum, the experts suggest the academic staff to combine the courses into larger units or modules that are completed with a single examination and that pursue compatible and coherent learning objectives. By doing so, the University could reduce the workload pressure on students and make the study program more competency-oriented.

Standard methods of didacticism and assessment (lectures, group work, laboratory work, midterm exams, and practical as well as written finals) constitute the general framework of the study program, though the University states that the Department of Health Management emphasizes interactive, exploratory teaching techniques. Nevertheless, the experts would like to strengthen the idea of a student-centered study program, encouraging students to take an even more active role in creating their own education process and developing a scholarly attitude.

From the experts' point of view, the requirements of this criterion are fulfilled.

### **3.3.3 Admission and Feasibility**

The admission to higher education institutions in Turkey is centrally regulated and executed by the Turkish Student Selection and Placement Center (OSYM) carrying out an aptitude test prepared in accordance with provisions specified by the Turkish Council of Higher Education (YÖK) and applying a calculation system determined in the Turkish Law on Higher Education No. 2547. All applicants for the study program must hold a secondary school certificate.

From the experts' point of view the admission requirements for the "Health Management" study program are appropriate to the level and the requirements of the study program. They are properly documented and made publicly available.

At the beginning of their studies, every student is assigned an academic advisor by the Head of Department who is in charge of supporting the educational and training proceeding of the student.

The experts determine a high amount of exams to be passed during the "Health Management" study program as each of the 48 courses require passing a midterm and a final exam. To compensate, the University observes the students' performance by collecting and generating the cumulative and semester Grade Point Average (GPA). Students with a GPA less than 1.80 out of 4.00 at the end of the fourth semester are put under academic probation. A student whose status is probation cannot attend to the courses of upper semesters until changing his/her status by improving his/her GPA. He/she must repeat some of the previous courses with the approval of his/her academic advisor to be able to change the status.

To facilitate the amount of exams, the type as well as the time of the different examinations is defined and communicated to the students transparently through the module description and at the beginning of the course.

The experts confirm that the University takes measures to guarantee the feasibility of the study program. As a whole, the organization of the education process ensures the successful implementation of the study program.

Although the "Health Management" study program is currently offered only in Turkish, the experts suggest promoting the students' English language skills. During the talks with students on site, it was hardly possible to hold discussions in English. The experts acknowledge that a professional discussion might be challenging. However, with regard to international compatibility and standards of academic education, the development of the students' English language skills should be strengthened. This is also necessary in case the Department decides to emphasize also on qualifying students for the market of health tourism.

From the experts' point of view, the requirements of this criterion are fulfilled.

### 3.3.4 Examination system and transparency

The University uses a continuous assessment process to ensure the quality of education for its students. This is achieved by evaluating the performance of the student through a series of exams and tests that are scheduled during the academic semester.

Students in the "Health Management" program are not required to write a Bachelor thesis or to carry out a graduation project. In order to equalize with international standards, the experts recommend implementing a Bachelor thesis that conclusively proves academic competences and fosters international competitiveness and compatibility.

In the experts' opinion, the study program requires a high amount of exams relative to the number of modules (2:1), which causes a high workload not only for students but also for the teaching staff (see also Criterion 3). Discussing the issue on site, staff as well as students are apparently satisfied with the exam procedures and see clear benefits in the current practice. The transparent information of examination methods and of the examination schedule at the beginning of each term makes the great number of assessments during and at the end of each semester manageable.

Thus, the experts conclude that the examinations, although numerous, serve to determine whether the envisaged qualification objectives have been achieved or not. These examinations are focused on students' knowledge. To compensate the high workload through the great amount of exams, the experts recommend implementing a greater variety and flexibility in examination methods and developing them towards a more competence-oriented examination design.

The study program has a system of assessment, conversion and recognition of students' competences and credits acquired and completed at IGU or other higher education institutions documented in the University's "Directive on Lateral Transfers". Turkey has signed the European Lisbon Recognition Convention.

Compensation measures for students with disabilities are given in the "IGU Directive On Disabled People Counseling And Coordination Unit" (Annex O). The stated aim of the Directive is to "ease" and "facilitate the life of disabled students" when necessary.



From the experts' point of view, the requirements of this criterion are fulfilled.

### **3.3.5 Teaching staff and material equipment**

The University appointed 24 staff members for teaching at the Department of Health Management, without counting instructors for the centrally regulated compulsory courses "Turkish Language I+II", "Foreign Language I+II" and "History of Ataturk's Principles and Reforms I+II". Whereas 12 of them are appointed to the Department of Health Management, the rest of the teaching load is covered through staff members who are assigned to other departments at the School of Health Sciences. The Head of Department is assistant professor and holds a PhD in Business Management. The University points out that the teaching staff is constantly amended in accordance with the department's needs but also depending on the availability of sufficiently qualified professionals. In concrete terms, the University has stated that it plans to hire one full or associate professor and two assistant professors in the Department of Health Management. The experts strongly reinforce this plan as they consider it necessary that one full professor with firm specialized and academic qualification in the area assures the academic and substantial development of the study program.

The experts conclude that the University has the capacities to cover the teaching load through interdepartmental exchange of teaching staff but see the necessity to request an updated plan indicating the prospective teaching staff needed to cover the teaching load, their academic title and qualification, the date of their (prospective) employment at the University, courses to be taught and job scope.

However, the experts determined room for enhancement regarding the English language skills of the teaching staff. The University should require the motivation, and offer and support more stringently possibilities to enhance language skills in teaching staff. In this regard, the experts recommend also promoting mobility of teaching staff and participation in international networks and conferences, especially since the University outlined the excellent conditions for staff promotion (covering travel expenses etc.).

On site, the University illustrated the variety of incentives and support given to faculty members in order to promote research and development. Members of the teaching staff are afforded opportunities to participate in international

symposia, congresses and conferences, as well as University-held training programs and research projects. Faculty is also rewarded for academic publication and high-level participation.

But the experts also learned on site, that most of the teaching staff signs contracts with the University on a one-year basis. As the University plans to grow and extend its offer in study programs, contracts are usually renewed regularly. However, the experts recommend offering more reliable employment prospects, especially to the young academic staff, in order to work on their academic development.

On site, the experts were shown around the University's and the School's premises.

In addition to the current main building of the School of Health Sciences, disposing 23 classrooms and lecture halls and 12 laboratories, the University purchased a new 30-floor building in order to provide space for future development, also for the School of Health Sciences. The University's central library offers room for individual studies and provides the most basic literature as printed books. On site, the experts learned that the main part of specialized literature is provided through an impressive number of electronic books, supplemented by databases and e-magazines. As a whole, it was ascertained by the experts that the Bachelor study program "Health Management" has ample available teaching facilities at its disposal.

In general, the experts determined a very favorable learning surrounding and acknowledge the University's efforts to create an inviting atmosphere for staff and students.

From the experts' point of view, the requirements of this criterion are partially fulfilled. One full professor with firm specialized and academic qualification in health management has to assure the academic and substantial development of the study program. An updated plan indicating the prospective teaching staff needed to cover the teaching load, their academic title and qualification, the date of their (prospective) employment at the University, courses to be taught and job scope has to be provided.

### 3.3.6 Quality assurance

From the experts' point of view, the University has a well-structured system of quality assurance which is overseen by a semi-independent quality board, directed by the University's rector and vice-rector. The board follows the European Higher Education System's standards for quality assurance and seeks to maintain a structure in each study program which is in line with international standards. Ensuring the participation of all internal and external stakeholders is a priority of the board. In total, 42 people within the University keep track of its quality assurance and holds weekly assessment meetings. Student representatives are delegated to boards on department, faculty/school and university level.

They carry out internal and external quality assurance procedures on a cyclical basis, among them course evaluations and student and teaching staff surveys. At the end of each semester, a course report is written and course specifications may be amended according to the evaluation results.

Students' workload is assessed and regulated through the Grade Point Average (GPA). Students with a GPA less than 1.80 out of 4.00 have to reduce their workload until they are able to improve their performance again.

The experts conclude that the University has a well-established, documented and published concept of quality assurance in education process, teaching and research, which serves as the basis for the quality-oriented development and implementation of the study program.

The results of the internal quality assurance management are applied for the continuous development of the study program. In doing so, the University takes into close consideration the quality evaluation results as well as the analyses of students' workload, their academic accomplishments and feedback from graduates.

Nevertheless, the experts determine that the quality management system is strongly concentrated on quantitative surveys. Little has been reported regarding definite measures and actions for quality enhancement derived from the evaluations. As a consequence, the experts strongly recommend implementing and strengthening also qualitative dimensions and evaluations, e.g. group discussions or so-called "Round Tables".

This would as well allow more student participation. As the experts consider students' personal development and civic commitment an essential part of academic education, the University should expand the promotion of student participation and encourage students to take more action in the developmental processes at the University.

From the experts' point of view, the requirements of this criterion are fulfilled.

### **3.3.7 Gender equality and equal opportunities**

Istanbul Gelisim University does neither follow an explicit gender equality concept nor a concept for promotion of equal opportunities for students with particular living circumstances. However, on site the experts got the impression that the University commits itself to provide an embracing environment for academic creativity and development, while respecting diversity and multicultural understanding.

The Department of Health Management accepts students of both genders and provides equal admission opportunity, education, examinations and participation chances for students of both genders. The University states its commitment to ensuring gender equality and seeks to administer its students on a solely academic basis. Facilities at the University are not gender-divided; resources are common amongst all "Health Management" students.

The University maintains a Disabled Student Unit, which is charged with taking necessary precautions to ensure maximally equal opportunities for disabled students. Such precautions include meeting the needs of disabled students in order to help them overcome personal obstacles; to design or re-organize teaching programs in ways that does not disadvantage or disrupt disabled students; to inform instructors and counselors about the needs of disabled students and to act as a proxy or liaison in this regard; to organize conferences and similar events for the benefit of the disabled; and to conduct what the University terms "positive discrimination," or affirmative-action.

The experts find the Disabled Student Unit to be effective and an important regulator empowered by Turkish Law No. 5378 of 1/7/2005, Article 15. The situation of gender equality is sufficient within the Child Development Department.

From the experts' perspective, gender equality and promotion of equal opportunities for students with particular living circumstances are implemented as a matter of course at Istanbul Gelisim University, although not determined as part of a concept.

From the experts' point of view, the requirements of this criterion are fulfilled.

### **3.4 Summary**

The overall impression of the University is positive; it presents itself as a fresh, well-equipped institution with a variety of disciplines. The experts conclude that the University disposes the motivation, the management's willingness and the financial and spatial resources to launch and push necessary steps and processes in order to reach its aim to provide high quality and comprehensive education and research. Within a relatively short period of time the University has shown a fast development and has reached impressive results.

As a whole, a number of additional favorable characteristics and achievements of the study program were demonstrated by the management of the University and the representatives of the college, the department and the student body. These include a multi-disciplinary and highly-motivated teaching team, a strong orientation on the needs of labor market and convincing ideas for the further development of the study program.

However, after a period characterized by fast growth, it seems advisable to slow down for a while, let all the new programs and achievements settle and observe the development of all the launched initiatives.

Based on the information from written documents and the results of the on-site visit, the experts came to the conclusion that the study program "Health Management" offered at the Istanbul Gelisim University fulfills, for the most part, the above described criteria. Hence, the experts decided to submit a recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS for a positive decision regarding the accreditation of the study program.

However, the experts recognize the fact that, from the perspective of European standards for higher education programs, the program "Health Management" leaves some room for improvement.

Based on these observations, the experts recommend the accreditation of the study program on the following conditions:

- The profile of the study program has to be sharpened: The qualification objectives have to be refined, especially with regard to the employability of the graduates.
- One full professor with established expertise in health management has to assure the academic development in the study program.
- An updated plan indicating the prospective teaching staff needed to cover the teaching load, their academic title and qualification, the date of their (prospective) employment at the University, courses to be taught and job scope has to be provided.

From the perspective of the experts, these conditions can be fulfilled within nine (9) months after the announcement of the accreditation decision.

For the continuous development of the study program, the experts have outlined the following recommendations:

- A modular structure should be aspired to. Courses should be combined into larger units/modules that are completed with a single examination.
- The Department of Health Management should use the scope left by the National Core Curriculum and include central topics which the experts were missing with regard to the variety of qualification objectives:
  - The examination of institutions, organizations and processes with a more specific connection to the context of the healthcare system should be depicted and intensified.
  - An insight into medical and healthcare professions during the course of studies should be considered in order to acquire a better and deeper understanding of the healthcare system and in order to contrast from general management.
  - Courses in epidemiology and public health should be included in the curriculum.
  - The examination and comparison of international healthcare systems and of the Turkish healthcare system should be implemented or become visible in the curriculum.
  - The training in academic and research skills should be implemented visibly, more intensely and earlier in the curriculum.
- The idea of a student-centered study program, encouraging students to take an even more active role in creating their own education process

- and developing a scholarly attitude, should be developed and implemented.
- The development of the students' English language skills should be strengthened.
  - A greater variety and flexibility in examination methods as well as a competence-oriented examination design should be implemented.
  - A Bachelor thesis should be implemented.
  - With regard to the targeted internationalization and staff development:
    - The English language skills should be more stringently assessed, and continuing professional training should be more stringently offered and attended. Mobility of teaching staff and participation in international field-related networks should be promoted.
    - More reliable employment prospects should be offered, especially to the young academic staff, in order to work on their academic development.
  - Qualitative dimensions and evaluations should become part of the quality assurance system.

## **4 Decision of the Accreditation Commission**

### **The decision of the Accreditation Commission of April 30, 2018**

This resolution of the Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS is based on the University's application, as well as the expert review and the on-site visit covered in the expert report. The Accreditation Commission has also taken the response opinion of the University regarding the study program into account.

The on-site visit of the University took place on January 18-19, 2018, according to the previously agreed-upon schedule.

The accreditation decision is based on the Accreditation Criteria developed by the AHPGS. The Accreditation Criteria are developed by the AHPGS in close accordance with the existing criteria and requirements valid in the Federal Republic of Germany and based on the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG), established by the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA).

The Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS discussed the procedural documents and the vote of the expert group and the response opinion of the University regarding the expert report.

In the response opinion, the University points out several steps launched for the further development of the study program and its premises. The Accreditation Commission welcomes the plan of the University.

The Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS adopts the following decision:

The study program "Health Management" is a full-time bachelor study program with a regulated study period of four years (eight semesters). The study program comprises 240 ECTS credit points, distributed into 48 mandatory courses, of which 38 are compulsory and ten are electives. The Bachelor study program "Health Management" is completed with awarding of the academic degree "Bachelor of Science." The study program is offered in Turkish language. Admission takes place every winter semester. The number of annually available study places in the program is determined annually by the Turkish Higher Education Council (YÖK) according to the University's resources. The first batch of students was admitted to the program in the academic year 2014/2015. Tuition fees are charged.



The study program "Health Management" is accredited for the duration of five years, until September 30, 2023.

Based on the expert report, the Accreditation Commission outlines the following conditions:

1. The profile of the study program has to be sharpened: The qualification objectives have to be refined, especially with regard to the employability of the graduates.
2. One full professor with established expertise in health management has to assure the academic development in the study program.
3. An updated plan indicating the prospective teaching staff needed to cover the teaching load, their academic title and qualification, the date of their (prospective) employment at the University, courses to be taught and job scope has to be provided.

The evidence that the formulated conditions have been fulfilled by the study program "Health Management" must be provided to AHPGS by January 30, 2019.

According to accreditation standards, in case of non-fulfillment of the conditions the accreditation of the study program will be revoked.

For further development and enhancement of the study program, as well as of the University as a whole, the Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS supports the recommendation articulated in the expert report.

## **Istanbul Gelisim University, Turkey, Bachelor Study Program "Health Management"**

On April 30, 2018, the Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS accredited the study program "Health Management" for the duration of five years, until September 30, 2023.

The following conditions were outlined:

1. The profile of the study program has to be sharpened: The qualification objectives have to be refined, especially with regard to the employability of the graduates.
2. One full professor with established expertise in health management has to assure the academic development in the study program.
3. An updated plan indicating the prospective teaching staff needed to cover the teaching load, their academic title and qualification, the date of their (prospective) employment at the University, courses to be taught and job scope has to be provided.

The evidence that the formulated conditions have been fulfilled had to be submitted until January 30, 2019.

On January 25, 2019, the University submitted the following documents:

- Employment plans for the fall and spring semesters,
- Short CVs of teachers of the department of Health Sciences,
- Document pertaining to department specific conditions.

In the submitted documents, the University outlines that several vacant positions have been filled in accordance with the Turkish Higher Education Council. One professor with a PhD in Health Management has been appointed to ensure the academic development of the study program.

In the document pertaining to the department specific conditions, the University outlines profile and qualifications objectives of the study program. Occupational areas and competencies to be achieved are described.

Furthermore, the University submitted a plan and short CVs indicating the academic and numerical sufficiency of the teaching staff in both the English- and Turkish-taught tracks. The plan includes information on employment dates, lecture hours, courses to be taught and academic degrees.

The Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS takes the following decision:

Based on the submitted documents, the Accreditation Commission of the AHPGS concludes that the conditions outlined on April 30, 2018 are fulfilled. On this basis, the decision about the accreditation of the study program "Health Management" maintains its validity until September 30, 2023.

Thus, the accreditation procedure is officially completed.